[The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. Todhunter] [11th March 1921

then the effect of that must be to reduce the payments we make towards services rendered. There are some honourable members who seem to think that they can have it both ways. I beg to assure them that it is quite impossible for us to find another 70 lakhs over and above everything else.

"Finally, I should like to say that it seems to me from this debate that there are several members of this House who would appear to combine in themselves the characters of the kindly Doctor Jekyll, who is always ready to consider the interests of the taxpayer, and the brutal Mr. Hyde, who loots him whenever he sees him. In the Financial Relations Committee, the two personalities were very evenly balanced and the result was a conflicting set of recommendations. In the budget debate which has just closed, Dr. Jekyll was very much in evidence in support of the taxpayer, and I hope that in voting on this motion he will again be in evidence and vote against the Mr. Hydes who are the enemies of the taxpayers."

Rao Bahadur A. S. Krishna Rao Pantulu :—"In view of the statement made by the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter that he will do his best to improve the resources of the local bodies, I do not wish to divide the House and I withdraw my resolution."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

The following resolution standing in the name of Mr. P. Siva Rao Pantulu was deemed to have been withdrawn under Standing Order No. 56 as the Member was absent.

"16. *That this Council recommends to the Government that the following recommendation of the Financial Relations Committee may be forthwith adopted :—*

"*That, until such legislation is passed sanctioning the surcharge on the abkari revenue, the Government should make over, to such local bodies as may require such help, a sum not exceeding one anna in the rupee of abkari revenue raised in their respective jurisdictions.*"

*Provincial Forest Service.*

Rai Sahib E. C. M. Mascarenhas :—"Mr. President, Sir, the resolution standing against my name runs as follows :—

'12. *This Council recommends to the Government that the two posts of Conservators of Forests recently sanctioned by the Secretary of State for India may be reserved for officers of the Provincial Forest Service.*'

"I must explain some details about the constitution of and recruitment to the Service. The Forest Service is divided into three parts, viz., the Indian or the Imperial Forest Service, the Provincial or the Madras Forest Service and the Subordinate Forest Service. The Indian Forest Service consists of Conservators, Deputy Conservators and Assistant Conservators. These are recruited in England. The Provincial or the Madras Forest Service consists of Deputy and Extra Assistant Conservators. The Subordinate Forest Service consists of Rangers, Foresters and Forest Guards. The men for the Provincial Forest Service are recruited both directly and also from the Subordinate Forest Service. Some years ago the Public Services Commission enquired into the grievances of the Provincial Forest officers and before that Commission the Provincial Forest Service officers adduced the following evidence :—

'At the outset we must state that this division of the service into Imperial Forest Service and Provincial or Madras Forest Service is impolitic. Officers who discharge the same duties under similar conditions with identical responsibilities

11th March 1921] [Mr. E. C. M. Mascarenhas]

should in the public interest be treated alike. To treat one section of this service as inferior all along the line must inevitably tend to demoralization. The present system deliberately excludes a whole class of officers from rising to the highest posts in the department and it is not too much to say that such a method is sure to depress and deteriorate the submerged lot, and it is most undesirable that this state of affairs should be prolonged a moment longer and be allowed to create a natural feeling of intense discontent among the officers. In the course of transfers of officers from one place to another a charge held to-day by an Imperial Forest Service officer comes under the control of a Provincial or Madras Forest Service officer. The inferior status of the latter is not lost sight of by not only the members of the other services in the locality but also by the men in the Subordinate Forest Service. In actual practical working this difference in status is a handicap for the Provincial or Madras Forest Service office. But we prefer to rest our position on the higher ground of common fairness and justice that men who discharge the same duties should, as far as possible, be put on the same level.'

"This was their grievance and after enquiry and subsequent representation made by the Provincial Forest officers it has been proposed to transfer the Extra Deputy Conservators into the Imperial Forest Service, and the pay of the Provincial Forest Service officers has also been raised. It is on behalf of these Provincial Forest officers who are shortly to be transferred to the Imperial Forest Service that I am making this motion that the two posts of Conservators recently sanctioned by the Secretary of State may be reserved for them. There were already four posts and the two that are now added make only one-third of the number."

Mr. M. D. Devadas :—"Mr. President, Sir, I have much pleasure in seconding this resolution. It is but fair, Sir, that the members of the Provincial Service should be allowed to get into the Indian Forest Service and ultimately rise to the position of Conservator of Forests. The two new posts that have been sanctioned have been sanctioned with a view to the efficiency of the department and if that is so, I think it is but fair that the Indian members of the Service should be given an opportunity of being appointed as Conservators of Forests. The resolution goes a little further than that and says that these two new posts should be reserved for Indians. Sir, it is a well-known fact that in other departments certain posts are listed and a certain portion is reserved for Indians. I think that in the case of the Forest Service also these two new posts that have been created should be reserved for the members of the Provincial Service who are mostly Indians—if not Indians, at least natives of this country. Therefore, Sir, I have much pleasure in seconding this resolution."

The Hon'ble Sir Lionel Davidson :—"Sir, I am really at a loss to understand why this resolution was brought before this Council. Because, as it seems to me, if I am not mistaken, the objects in view have already been fully secured by the decisions of the Government of India. I have before me a letter which was received many months ago containing the orders passed by the Secretary of State and the Government of India on the recommendations of the Public Services Commission with regard to the Imperial and the Provincial branches of the Forest Service. These orders take effect from May 1920, and they provide definitely for the inclusion in the Imperial Forest Service of selected members of the Provincial Forest Service. I believe I am right in saying that quite recently no less than seven officers from the Provincial Service were transferred to and incorporated in the Imperial Forest Service as members of that Service. I think the whole class of Extra Deputy Conservators has been moved over. In other words, the object which Mr. Devadas has particularly in view, viz., that members of the Provincial

[The Hon'ble Sir Lionel Davidson] [11th March 1921

Service should have an opportunity of admission into the Indian Forest Service, has already been achieved and nothing more remains to be done. Mr. Devadas says that ultimately they should be given an opportunity of becoming Conservators. The decisions of the Government of India and the Secretary of State have reserved that opportunity. I will read the relevant portion. 'Officers promoted from the Provincial to the Imperial Service * * * will be eligible for promotion to administrative rank equally with directly recruited members of Imperial Service.' This being so, Sir, I fail to see what conceivable grievance there can be on the part of members of the Provincial Forest Service. There is no question of reserving particular appointments for officers of a particular race. I should like to emphasize that, once in the Imperial Forest Service, promotion to the administrative rank depends and must always depend upon ability and not upon race. I have just stated that all the Extra Deputy Conservators on the list have already been transferred to the Imperial Service. What then would be the effect of reserving for members of the Provincial Forest Service these two posts of Conservator, which, I may say in passing, have already been filled up by selection? The result would be that the Government would have either to keep those two posts vacant or to appoint to them officers who have been definitely refused any further promotion for incompetence or officers of less than nine years' service, quite junior and quite unfit to hold the post of Conservator. That is a *reductio ad absurdum*. In the light of my remarks I hope the honourable member will not press the resolution."

Rai Sahib E. C. M. MASCARENHAS :—"I have the latest list of Forest Officers here and I do not see the transfer of the Extra Deputy Conservators as mentioned. They still remain in a separate part of the list."

The Hon'ble Sir LIONEL DAVIDSON :—"Whether their names appear in a separate part of the list or not it is a fact that they have come into the Imperial Forest Service."

The Hon'ble the PRESIDENT : —"Does the honourable member wish to press his resolution ?"

Rai Sahib E. C. M. MASCARENHAS :—"In view of what the Hon'ble the Home Member has said I withdraw my resolution."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

*Flood ventways near Chidambaram.*

Mr. A. T. MUTTUKUMARASWAMI CHETTIYAR :—'Mr. President, Sir, I beg to move the following resolution :—

'13. *That this Council recommends to the Government that the South Indian Railway Company be moved to construct two or three flood ventways near Chidambaram and Varkalpet railway stations in order to protect them against floods.*'

"Sir, I move this resolution with the object of removing the great hardships felt, in the rainy season, by the people who travel by train and also by those who possess lands in the western side of the railway lines. I take Chidambaram. There is a channel called Palaman. It is between the town and the station. In the rainy season the water in the channel overflows on the road on both sides of the railway bridge, so that traffic between the station and the town ceases for more than 12 hours or for 15 hours during the time of the floods. Last year there was no traffic for more than 36 hours. As an instance I may say that I myself suffered during the last flood. I went to Chidambaram one morning and found that there was no traffic from the station to the town and that some of